

Coordinating Multilevel Governance in the City of Toronto



Martin Horak

Presentation to IPAC forum on 'Foundations of Governance'
Toronto, March 25, 2010

Municipalities and Multilevel Governance

Multilevel governance: Coordinating policy across levels of governance

Toronto: A leader in bottom-up coordination efforts. Both successes and failures.

Question: What explains the variable track record of multilevel coordination initiatives in Toronto?

Toronto: four 'bottom-up' initiatives

Case	Timeframe	Lead institutions
Securing multilevel transit funding	2000 - 2008	City Council; Toronto Intergovernmental Relations Office
Coordinating emergency management	1999 - ongoing	Toronto Office of Emergency Management
Implementing the Tourism Action Plan	2003 - 2008	City Council; municipal tourism administrators
Revitalizing the Central Waterfront	1999 - ongoing	City Council; Waterfront Revitalization Corporation

The Cases: Success and Failure

Case	Initial goals achieved?	Local stakeholders satisfied?
Securing multilevel transit funding	yes	yes
Revitalizing the central waterfront	in part	mostly
Coordinating emergency management	in part	in part
Implementing the Tourism Action Plan	mostly not	no

Multilevel TTC Funding: A Success Story



TTC Funding: Case History

The problem: Withdrawal of provincial funding for TTC in late 1990s; fiscal crisis.

The response (1): Build big-city lobbying alliance focused on federal government.

The response (2): Focus all Toronto intergovernmental infrastructure funding demands on TTC capital needs. Maintain consistent political attention to the issue; take advantage of political change at other levels.

The result: Almost \$500 million in annual intergovernmental assistance for the TTC.

Intergovernmental funding for TTC, 2000-2007 (\$ million)

	2000	2001	2002	2003	2004	2005	2006	2007
Provincial	0	0	63	141	141	159	271	329
Federal	0	0	62	14	12	163	166	112
Total	0	0	125	155	153	322	437	441

Note: All of the federal funding listed is for capital purposes. Provincial figures include operating subsidies, which started at \$70 million in 2003 and increased to about \$90 million in 2005 and thereafter.

Source: Toronto Transit Commission Annual Reports 2002-2008.

Explaining success and failure across the cases: Coordination challenges

Cases	Initial power fragmentation	Initial agenda fragmentation	Goals achieved?	Local agents satisfied?
Securing multilevel transit funding	quite low	quite low	yes	yes
Revitalizing the Central Waterfront	quite high	high	in part	mostly
Coordinating emergency management	quite high	quite low	in part	in part
Implementing the Tourism Action Plan	high	high	mostly not	no

Overcoming coordination challenges: Four insights for municipal officials

1. Ensure that administration is internally united.
2. Offer sustained political leadership.
3. Anticipate and seize windows of policy opportunity at other levels of government.
4. Be prepared to share authority with other actors in return for their longer-term cooperation.

Transit revisited: Complex coordination in a changing context

Contextual changes in recent years:

- decline of federal government interest in urban issues
- regional approach to transit by the provincial government

Implications for Toronto:

- threat that the City's interests will be marginalized in the intergovernmental arena
- need for the City to develop horizontal collaboration strategies at the city-regional scale